

**PROSPECTS AND POLICY OPTIONS FOR THAILAND'S TRADE IN
BIOENERGY IN THE MEKONG:
IMPLICATIONS FOR SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT**

Ms. Sabrina Shaw

A Dissertation Submitted in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements
for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Thai Studies

Faculty of Arts

Chulalongkorn University

Academic Year 2009

Copyright Chulalongkorn University

โอกาสและทางเลือกเชิงนโยบายทางการดำเนินงานซึ่งวิภาพของไทยใน

ภูมิภาคลุ่มน้ำโขง: นัยที่สำคัญต่อการพัฒนาที่ยั่งยืน



นาง ชาบรีนา ซอร์

วิทยานิพนธ์นี้เป็นส่วนหนึ่งของการศึกษาตามหลักสูตรปริญญาอักษรศาสตรดุษฎีบัณฑิต

สาขาวิชาไทยศึกษา

คณะอักษรศาสตร์ จุฬาลงกรณ์มหาวิทยาลัย

ปีการศึกษา 2552

ลิขสิทธิ์ของจุฬาลงกรณ์มหาวิทยาลัย

521121

ชาบรินา ซอร์: โอกาสและทางเลือกเชิงนโยบายทางการค้าพลังงานชีวภาพของไทยใน
ภูมิภาคลุ่มน้ำโขง: นัยที่สำคัญต่อการพัฒนาที่ยั่งยืน. PROSPECTS AND POLICY
OPTIONS FOR THAILAND'S TRADE IN BIOENERGY IN THE MEKONG:
IMPLICATIONS FOR SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT) อ.ที่ปรึกษาวิทยานิพนธ์หลัก:
ผู้ช่วยศาสตราจารย์ ดร. จาริต ดิงศภัทย์, 486 หน้า

วิทยานิพนธ์นี้ค้นคว้าองค์ประกอบของปรากฏการณ์ "เกษตรพลังงาน" หรือ "bioenergy"
การรวมกลุ่มเศรษฐกิจระหว่างประเทศในระดับภูมิภาค (Regional integration) และการพัฒนา
อย่างยั่งยืน ที่มีการค้าเป็นเครื่องมือสำคัญต่อการนำมาสู่ความร่วมมือระหว่างประเทศ ประเทศไทย
ได้ส่งเสริมเชื้อเพลิงชีวมวลเชิงพาณิชย์เพื่อสนับสนุนนโยบายด้านพลังงานของประเทศในการ
เพิ่มแหล่งพลังงานหมุนเวียนถึงร้อยละ 8 ในปี ค.ศ. 2011 ถึงปัจจุบันจะมีนโยบายพลังงานทดแทน
ที่ชัดเจนแล้ว แต่การประเมินผลกระทบทางสังคมและสิ่งแวดล้อมยังจำเป็นต้องมีการพัฒนาให้มี
ประสิทธิภาพและพอเพียงกับแนวทางการพัฒนาประเทศเกษตรพลังงาน แนวคิดของงานวิจัยฉบับ
นี้ปรากฏจากหลักวิชาการพัฒนาอย่างยั่งยืนในภูมิภาคลุ่มน้ำโขงภายในบริบทที่สะท้อนถึงทฤษฎี
ภาวะทันสมัยและการเป็นสมัยใหม่มีได้หลายแบบ วิเคราะห์หลักทฤษฎีของการพัฒนาเกษตร
พลังงานในมิตินโยบายจาก 6 กรณีศึกษา โดยการสัมภาษณ์เชิงลึก การสนทนากลุ่ม และ
แบบสอบถาม เทียบเคียงรูปแบบการพัฒนา "ไบโอดีเซล" จากประเทศบราซิลโดยขยายถึง
ความหมายใหม่ของภาวะทันสมัยบนพื้นฐานโครงสร้างสถาปัตยกรรมเกษตรพลังงานส่วนภูมิภาค

ข้อสรุปที่สำคัญของงานวิจัยนี้คือรูปแบบการพัฒนาพลังงานชีวภาพของประเทศไทยมี
ศักยภาพในการทำให้เกิดความหลากหลายในการเกษตร เพิ่มมูลค่าให้กับสินค้าเกษตรและเกษตร
เชิงการค้า ตลอดจนเห็นถึงความสำคัญของความเชื่อมโยงระหว่างเกษตรพลังงานกับการ
พัฒนาประเทศอย่างยั่งยืน อุปสงค์ที่เพิ่มขึ้นของชีวมวล อาทิ มันสำปะหลังอ้อยสำหรับการผลิตเอ
ทานอลน้ำมันปาล์มและสบู่ดำสำหรับการผลิตน้ำมันดีเซลอาจส่งผลให้เกิดความไม่สมดุลในการ
ขยายการเกษตรกรรมไปจนถึงภูมิภาคลุ่มน้ำโขง ด้วยงานนี้ การสร้างสมดุลในมิติที่แตกต่างของ
นโยบายระหว่างผู้มีส่วนได้ส่วนเสียจึงจำเป็นต้องมีการประสานกระบวนการเปลี่ยนแปลงสู่การพัฒนา
อย่างยั่งยืนโดยการให้ความสำคัญและผสมผสานกลุ่มเกษตรย่อยและหลักเลี้ยงการนำตลาดโดย
ผู้ประกอบการหรือผู้ลงทุนรายใหญ่ในการปลูกพืชเชิงเดี่ยว

สาขาวิชา ไทยศึกษา

ปีการศึกษา 2552

ลายมือชื่อนิติ...

ลายมือชื่ออ.ที่ปรึกษาวิทยานิพนธ์หลัก

Labriana E. Sor
A. K.

508 0519 022: MAJOR: THAI STUDIES

KEYWORDS: AGROENERGY / BIOENERGY / SUSTAINABLE

DEVELOPMENT / TRADE & ENVIRONMENT / POLICY OPTIONS / REGIONAL TRADE INTEGRATION / COMMUNITY-BASED RESOURCE MANAGEMENT/ THAILAND / MEKONG REGION

SABRINA SHAW: PROSPECTS AND POLICY OPTIONS FOR THAILAND'S TRADE IN BIOENERGY IN THE MEKONG: IMPLICATIONS FOR SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT; ADVISOR: ASSISTANT PROFESSOR CHARIT TINGSABADH, Ph.D.,486 pp.

This thesis examines the emerging dynamics of agroenergy, sustainable development and regional integration in the Mekong region, where trade has become the currency of cooperation. Thailand has commercialised biofuels to contribute to the national target to increase renewable energy sources to 8% by 2011. Whilst Thailand has signalled a new era with its renewable energy strategies, there has yet to be sufficient assessment of the socio-environmental effects of the agricultural shifts entailed. The conceptual framework for this thesis sets the Mekong agroenergy discourse in the context of the theories of reflexive modernisation and regional modernities. It examines agroenergy development in theory, policy and practice through empirical analysis based on field study of six cases, indepth interviews, focus groups and a survey questionnaire, with Brazil's agroenergy experience as a comparative model. This work elaborates a new interpretation of modernisation based on an agroecological framework that incorporates smallholders in the regional energy matrix.

The main conclusions are that Thailand's bioenergy model has the potential to diversify and add value to its agricultural production and trade while addressing sustainable development. However, increasing demand for agricultural feedstocks, such as cassava and sugarcane for ethanol and palm oil for biodiesel, may encourage unsustainable agricultural expansion in neighbouring Mekong countries. There is a rupture in policy making between different stakeholders that needs to be addressed by coordinated change towards sustainable development that integrates smallholders and avoids business as usual scenarios driving large-scale monoculture plantations.

Field of Study: Thai Studies

Academic Year: 2009

Student's Signature. *Sabrina Shaw*
Advisor's Signature. *[Signature]*

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My gratitude is extended to my supervisor Charit Tingsabadh for his infectious intellectual curiosity. To Chatthip Nartsupha for taking me under his wings at Setsiri and encouraging me to take my research into the field. To Samai Jai-In for his courage of conviction and inspiration. To Bundhit Eua-Arporn for his constructive criticism. This thesis was possible with the support of the Thai Studies Department, Chulalongkorn University, particularly Siraporn Nathalong and Suchitra Chongstitvantana, with Thep, Sitara, Narut and PhD colleagues always ready to help. Professors Chantana, Kalaya, Surichai, Chanetwallop & Supamit also encouraged me.

This research owes a debt of gratitude to the many people interviewed who gave their time, energy and practical experience to help me understand the agroenergy landscape and who guided me through the field, especially Nopadol Suanprasert, Thongchanh Sengsoulivong, Athiras Dumdee and Sawaeng Ruaysoongnern. To Thanpuying Suthawan, Khunying Laxanachantorn, Sitanon Jesdapipat, Sunanta Kangvalkulkij, Parate Attavipach, Muanpong Juntopas, Andrew Bartlett and LaoFAB for insights on the Mekong. To Jin, Kate and Pichai for translations. To Tariq Banuri for trusting me with his course at Chula. To Christer Holstberg, Anders Granlund, Stuart Ward and SENSE for so many opportunities. To Rosalia Sciortino, Tira Foran, Bunchoon Wongseelashote, Sudip Rakshit and Tom Callander for debates.

This thesis was inspired and partially funded by a project on the Mekong with Mark Halle and colleagues at the International Institute for Sustainable Development, in cooperation with Krirk-Krai Jirapaet, Sorajak Kasemsuvan, Watcharas Leelawath and Bunchorn Songsamphant (ITD). The research benefitted from conferences organised by Ricardo Meléndez, Marie Chamay, Chayan Vaddanaphuti, Philip Hirsch, Peter Vandergeest and Shabbir Gheewala. I owe a debt of intellectual gratitude to John Kirton, Sylvia Ostry, David Runnalls and Ronald Steenblik.

In the Shaw Family's globetrotting tradition, my parents and family accompanied me on many field visits and endured endless debates on my research, enabling me to finalise this thesis despite the trials and turmoils of moving across the planet. I would like to share the pleasure of this accomplishment with my parents, Ursula and Donald; my partner in life, Francisco; and my children, Benjamin and Gabriel. This research is dedicated to them.

CONTENTS

ABSTRACT (THAI)	iv
ABSTRACT (ENGLISH)	v
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	vi
CONTENTS	vii
LIST OF TABLES	xi
LIST OF FIGURES	xiii
LIST OF BOXES	xv
LIST OF PHOTOGRAPHS	xvi
LIST OF MAPS	xviii
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xix
GLOSSARY OF TERMS	xxi
CHAPTER I: INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Setting the context.....	1
1.2 Rationale for the study	2
1.3 Research objectives.....	4
1.4 Hypothesis.....	4
1.5 Significance, scope and limitations of the research	5
1.6 Literature review	6
1.7 Structure of the thesis.....	15
CHAPTER II: CONCEPTUAL AND THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK	17
2.1 Sustainable development	18
2.2 Trade liberalisation and environmental sustainability	23
2.3 Sustainable development from the perspective of multiple modernities	41
2.4 Moving from theory to practice: evidence from Thailand & the Mekong.....	56
2.5 Conclusion: engaging the Mekong in sustainability	79

CHAPTER III: RESEARCH APPROACH AND METHODS.....	82
3.1 Research methodology	82
3.2 Data requirements	83
3.3 Primary data collection and analysis.....	85
3.4 Treatment of the data	100
CHAPTER IV: THAILAND'S BIOENERGY POLICIES & PROSPECTS	103
4.1 Bioenergy in Thailand: facts and figures	103
4.2 Thailand's national legislation and international obligations	116
4.3 Thailand's bioenergy policies	132
4.4 Regional energy framework.....	154
4.5 Conclusion: challenges and opportunities in bioenergy development.....	164
CHAPTER V: BIOENERGY PRACTICE IN THE MEKONG.....	169
5.1 Scoping agroenergy sustainability: land and water.....	170
5.2 Case narratives of bioenergy	173
5.3 Findings from the field research, interviews, focus groups and survey.....	252
5.4 Global concerns, regional trends, local narratives	282
5.5 Conclusion: an emerging regional modernity	290
CHAPTER VI: THAILAND'S POLICY OPTIONS FOR BIOENERGY	294
6.1 Introduction: policy options for bioenergy	294
6.2 Main issues concerning bioenergy	295
6.3 Thailand's policy options: navigating a sustainability transition.....	310
6.4 The preferred policy option: proactive regional cooperation.....	324
6.5 Implementing the preferred policy option of <i>Small is Smart</i>	325

CHAPTER VII: CONCLUSION	328
7.1 Is current bioenergy practice sustainable?	328
7.2 Revisiting the theory of multiple modernities.....	333
7.3 Recommendations for bioenergy in the Mekong.....	337
7.4 Further research to embed sustainable development in the Mekong	340
7.5 Conclusion: orchestrating a regional modernity	342
7.6 Epilogue	345
REFERENCES	345
APPENDICES.....	390
Appendix A: List of informant organisations by category.....	391
Appendix B: Key informant interview questions (English version).....	396
Appendix C: Key informant interview questions (Thai version).....	399
Appendix D: Mekong bioenergy survey questionnaire (English).....	404
Appendix E: Mekong bioenergy survey questionnaire (Thai).....	405
Appendix F: Focus group discussion points.....	407
Appendix G: List of key informant interviews	408
Appendix H: Conferences, meetings and field trips.....	443
Appendix I: List of focus groups.....	447
Appendix J: List of legal instruments related to bioenergy in Thai law	456
Appendix K: Global picture of ethanol production.....	458
Appendix L: Global picture of biodiesel production.....	459
Appendix M: Data Analysis of informant questionnaire responses	459
Appendix N: Climate change hotspots in Southeast Asia.....	471
Appendix O: CBD development of sustainability guidelines for biofuels.....	472
Appendix P: Thai National Interpretation of the RSPO principles and criteria..	475

Appendix Q: Paper to the World Renewable Energy Congress, 2009..... 482

Appendix R: Agrarian Transformations in Southeast Asia Conference 484

BIOGRAPHY..... 486

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Matrix on bioenergy trade and environment linkages.....	34
Table 2: Research components: integrating theory, policy and practice	84
Table 3: Informants by category and method of data collection	85
Table 4: Categories of informants and interview questions	88
Table 5: Focus group by category of informant	91
Table 6: Survey questionnaire	92
Table 7: Questionnaire – frequency count in each informant category.....	93
Table 8: Case studies of community and commercial bioenergy	93
Table 9: Field trips.....	94
Table 10: Conferences	96
Table 11: Meetings, lectures and workshops.....	97
Table 12: Causal chain for socio-environmental impacts in agroenergy	101
Table 13: Thailand’s major agricultural products and world ranking, 2008	114
Table 14: Thailand’s five-year Energy Conservation Plan (2007-2011).....	119
Table 15: Subsidies for small power producers (May 2009).....	120
Table 16: Sustainable development criteria for CDM projects in Thailand.....	131
Table 17: Alternative Energy Development Plan targets by 2022	135
Table 18: Alternative energy promotion measures (2008-2022).....	136
Table 19: Ethanol production capacity, 2009	138
Table 20: Thailand’s ethanol production capacity, 2009 (Million Liters).....	138
Table 21: Recent national resolutions related to ethanol.....	140
Table 22: Biodiesel production capacity (2009).....	145
Table 23: Recent national resolutions relating to biodiesel.....	146
Table 24: Tariff quota commitments, imports under tariff quotas	150
Table 25: Products subject to import licensing and prohibition in Thailand, 2007....	150
Table 26: Case study narratives of community and commercial bioenergy.....	174
Table 27: Farmer income for selected crops, 2009.....	176
Table 28: Small-scale oil palm cultivation, Dumdee Biodiesel, Aoluk, Krabi	197
Table 29: Fresh Fruit Bunch utilisation, Krabi.....	199

Table 30: Comparison of rubber and oil palm in Thailand	204
Table 31: Comparison of the ethanol yield for various agroenergy crops	212
Table 32: Comparison of the biodiesel yield in Thailand.....	213
Table 33: Different planting arrangements.....	231
Table 34: Main drivers of biofuel policy	255
Table 35: Main challenges to ethanol and biodiesel development	256
Table 36: Leadership at the national and regional level on bioenergy	258
Table 37: Is the biofuels sector heading along the right path as of 2009?.....	260
Table 38: Opportunities and challenges for agroenergy	270
Table 39: Total OECD subsidies to biofuels	299
Table 40: Bound biofuel tariffs in selected countries (2009)	304
Table 41: Policy options by scenario	312

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1: Global trends in output; nitrogen, phosphorous; irrigation & pesticides.....	22
Figure 2: Thailand's bioenergy development, 2007-2011.....	105
Figure 3: Gasoline and gasohol consumption in Thailand, 2003-2008.....	105
Figure 4: Biodiesel consumption, 2007-2009 (ML/day).....	106
Figure 5: Composition of energy sources in Thailand, 2008.....	111
Figure 6: Final energy consumption by sector 2008.....	111
Figure 7: Comparison of share of primary energy, selected Asian countries.....	112
Figure 8: Shares of final energy consumption by fuel, 2008.....	113
Figure 9: Fuel imports versus agricultural exports, 1995-2008.....	115
Figure 10: National Energy Policy Council, 1992.....	116
Figure 11: Energy efficiency labels, Thailand.....	129
Figure 12: Alternative Energy Development Plan (2008-2022).....	134
Figure 13: Thailand's Gasohol Strategic Plan.....	139
Figure 14: Ethanol plants in Thailand, 2009.....	145
Figure 16: Thailand's Biodiesel Strategic Plan.....	146
Figure 17: Small and smart model of biodiesel production.....	182
Figure 18: Biodiesel manufacturing through transesterification.....	198
Figure 19: Water allocation 2009-2010.....	207
Figure 20: Location of cassava mills and ethanol plants.....	211
Figure 21: Flow chart of cassava-based ethanol production.....	212
Figure 22: Energy costs from ethanol processing.....	214
Figure 23: Cartoon depicting an Arab investor selling Thai rice to Thais.....	236
Figure 24: Jatropha cultivation area by type, 2008.....	241
Figure 25: Potential productivity of Jatropha (with present variety), 2009.....	245
Figure 26: Harvested Jatropha areas, 2008.....	246
Figure 27: Summary of supply concerns.....	247
Figure 28: Proportion of oil seed crops 2006-2007.....	248
Figure 29: Agricultural land use in Thailand, 2007.....	262
Figure 30: Energy crop plantation areas in Thailand.....	263

Figure 31: Land holding distribution in Thailand.....	268
Figure 32: Key global tapioca exporters, 2008.....	273
Figure 33: Balancing bioenergy policy making.....	285
Figure 34: Economic integration and policy space.....	305
Figure 35: Regional integration and policy space for sustainability	308

LIST OF BOXES

Box 1: Economic and biodiversity corridors in the Mekong region	11
Box 2: <i>Jatropha Curcas</i> (<i>Sabudam</i> in Thai).....	189
Box 3: Champassak Priority Investment Area: Agriculture	222

LIST OF PHOTOGRAPHS

Photo 1: Royal Chitralada biodiesel inauguration, 1985	178
Photo 2: Jarun Putson, orange turned oil palm farmer, Rangsit, central Thailand	180
Photo 3: Samai Jai-In with Jarun Putson, Rangsit, central Thailand.....	180
Photo 4: Sawaeng Ruaysoongnern, Learning Center for Energy Sufficiency.....	187
Photo 5: Local oil nuts for biodiesel prepared by Pra Tawee, Wat Sua	187
Photo 6: Sabudam (Jatropha).....	187
Photo 7: Pra Tawee, community biodiesel press, Learning Center	188
Photo 8: Pra Tawee demonstrates an oil nut press, Wat Sua, Si Prajam	188
Photo 9: Thong Mo, organic agricultural expert and teacher, Supanburi.....	190
Photo 10: Pra Tawee with oil-nut biodiesel and biochar briquettes, Si Prajam	190
Photo 11: The author with Noy Putdawian, Chumpae, northeastern Thailand	192
Photo 12: Earthen kiln used to heat the biochar briquettes, Wat Sua, Si Prajam	192
Photo 13: Local level policy coordination on biofuels, Vanghinlad, Khon Kaen.....	193
Photo 14: Sawaeng Ruaysoongnern with Vanghinlad farmers at farmers' school	193
Photo 15: Pra Sunee and Athiras Dumdee with Sawaeng Ruaysoongnern	195
Photo 16: Athiras Dumdee with biodiesel	196
Photo 17: Ohm Dumdee showcasing his innovations for oil palm	196
Photo 18: Athiras Dumdee explains his palm oil processing techniques, Aoluk	199
Photo 19: Wichuda Dumdee at the Krabi Oil Palm Farmers Cooperatives plant	199
Photo 20: Trucks entering the Cooperative crushing mill, Krabi.....	200
Photo 21: Benjamin and Gabriel Shaw Cannabrava pump community biodiesel.....	200
Photo 22: Intercropping of oil palm and rubber, Krabi, southern Thailand	201
Photo 23 and Photo 24: Krabi Oil Palm Farmers Cooperatives Federation plant.....	209
Photo 25: Thai contract farming in Champassak, Lao PDR.....	224
Photo 26: Thongchanh Sengsoulivong with Ursula Shaw, Champassak	224
Photo 27: Thai bioenergy concession outside Pakse	228
Photo 28: Thongchanh Sengsoulivong , District Agriculture & Forestry Office	228
Photo 29: Field study guided by Thongchanh Sengsoulivong, Champassak	230

Photo 30: Biofuel Decree in Myanmar, Ethnic Community Development Forum	240
Photo 31: Jatropha plantation, Magway, Myanmar	242
Photo 32: Mechanical Jatropha harvester, Thailand.....	242
Photo 33 and Photo 34: Jatropha cultivation manuals, Myanmar	243
Photo 35: Jatropha plantation, Magway, Myanmar	244
Photo 36: Scattered fence type, Magway, Dept of Agricultural Research	244
Photo 37: Scattered fence-type Jatropha along agrifields, Myanmar	245
Photo 38: Jatropha intercropping, Lungyaw farms, Magway, Myanmar	245
Photo 39: Jatropha plantation, Shan state, Myanmar	246
Photo 40: Hand sorting Jatropha seeds, Taunggi, Shan State	246
Photo 41: World Tapioca Conference, Bangkok, January 2009	274
Photo 42: Klanarong Sriroth, Kasetsart University with first prize cassava root.....	275
Photo 43: Tapioca: the Magic Plant.....	276
Photo 44: Asia's leader in Renewable energy, Chitralada Biofuels Project.....	276
Photo 45: Miguel Oliveiro, Brazilian agro-industrialist.....	280
Photo 46: The author with Samai Jai-In; Asian Biofuels Dialogue.....	443
Photo 47: Thai National day, Brasilia, Brazil, 4 December 2009	444
Photo 48: the author with Ursula Shaw, Global Renewable Energy Forum	448
Photo 49: Fórum Mundial das América, África e Amazonia, Brasilia.....	448

LIST OF MAPS

Map 1: The Mekong region	xxvi
Map 2: Thailand's regional network.....	155
Map 3: Land productivity loss due to land degradation	184
Map 4: Jatropha cultivation beltway	189
Map 5: Lao PDR.....	223
Map 6: Champassak investment zones, 2009.....	225
Map 7: Main Jatropha production areas, Myanmar 2009.....	243
Map 8: Fence style Jatropha cultivation, Lungyaw Farm, Mandalay district	247
Map 9: Tanintharyi Division, Myanmar.....	249